



Don Schonhardt, Mayor

3800 Municipal Way, Hilliard, OH 43026 | Phone 614 - 876 - 7361 | www.hilliardohio.gov

**STAFF REPORT
PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION
FEBRUARY 11, 2016**

CASE 1: 15-0191LR – Tarlton Meadows – 4608 and 4643 Elliott Road and the northern-most 30.2 acres of land within the Estates at Hoffman Farms PUD

PARCEL NUMBER: 050-008664, 050-009195, 120-000184, 120-000185, and 120-000173

APPLICANT: Elliot Road, LLC c/o Thomas L. Hart, 2 Miranova Place, Suite 700, Columbus, Ohio 43215, and City of Hilliard c/o Clyde R. Seidle, 3800 Municipal Way, Hilliard, OH 43026.

REQUEST: Review and approval of a Hilliard Conservation District under the provisions of Hilliard Code Chapter 1115.04 for a development consisting of 278 dwelling units and 46.7 acres of park land on 190.4 acres.

UPDATE:

On May 12, 2015, the Big Darby Accord Panel recommended that the proposal be denied based on the findings that the proposal is not a conservation development design; wetland buffer information was insufficient; density is too high; and open space does not meet the 75 percent contiguity standard for conservation development. The Planning and Zoning Commission has postponed this application at the request of the applicant on June 11, 2015, August 13, 2015, October 8, 2015, and December 10, 2015. The applicant has since revised the proposed plans. The following staff report is based on those plans.

BACKGROUND:

The site is 190.4 acres located on the east and west sides of Elliott Road approximately 3,000 feet south of Hayden Run Road. The site includes approximately 30.2 acres of park land approved as part of the Estates at Hoffman Farms PUD, 113.5 acres between Estates at Hoffman Farms and Elliott Road, and 46.7 acres on the west side of Elliott Road within Brown Township. The applicant is requesting approval of a Hilliard Conservation District (HCD) Plan consisting of 278 single-family lots on 190.4 acres.

COMMISSION ROLE:

The Commission is to review the proposal for conformance to the provisions of the Hilliard Comprehensive Plan and Chapter 1115 of the Zoning Code. Following a recommendation by the Commission, an ordinance for the proposed PUD Zoning will be forwarded to City Council for review and approval.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the proposed plan is not consistent with the recommendations in the Hilliard Comprehensive Plan. Based on this finding, staff cannot recommend approval of the plan as proposed. Staff recommends that the plans are revised and submitted for review by the Planning and Zoning Commission after the following issues are addressed:

- 1) That the plans are revised to show density consistent with the recommendations in the Hilliard Comprehensive Plan and the provisions of the Zoning Code;
- 2) That the plans are revised to show a landscaped buffer of not less than 50 feet in width between the proposed Subarea C and the adjacent properties to the north;
- 3) That the plans are revised to show a layout that is consistent with the provisions of the Hilliard Design Manual Chapter 4 to ensure that neighborhood planning and design goals are met including street length and width, block length, multiple connections to adjacent neighborhoods, pedestrian and bicycle facilities, buffer zone, vehicle speed management, and on-street parking provisions;
- 4) That the plans are revised to show that only front or side elevations of houses will be visible from Elliott Road;
- 5) That examples of specific architectural details and additional mounding/landscaping required for the key visibility locations are provided;
- 6) That the plans are revised to show the regional bike path across the entire site from east to west including the proposed park land in Subarea 'D';
- 7) That the 46.7 acres of park land is dedicated prior to the issuance of any building permit;
- 8) That the applicant will enter into a Developer's Agreement with the City regarding construction and financing of all public improvements; and
- 9) That the text and plans are revised consistent with the recommendations listed in this staff report prior to this application being scheduled on any Council agenda.

CONSIDERATIONS:

- The 190.4-acre site is zoned R-R, Rural Residential, PUD, Planned Unit Development, and Rural (Brown Township). Much of the site has been farmed for years. The western portion of the 30.2-acre park land has an existing 1-million-gallon municipal water tower. There is an existing wetland in the eastern portion of the site. To the east are single-family residences within the Estates at Hoffman Farms subdivision zoned PUD, and the Heritage Rail Trail. To the north are single-family estate lots and undeveloped land within Brown Township zoned R, Rural. To the west and south is undeveloped land within Brown Township zoned R, Rural.
- The proposal is to rezone the 143.7 acres on the east side of Elliott Road to HCD, Hilliard Conservation District for 278 single-family lots. Two vehicular access points are proposed on Elliott Road. Additional connections are proposed to the Estates at Hoffman Farms subdivision and to the adjacent properties to the northeast, north and south. Multi-use paths are proposed along the site's Elliott Road frontage and to connect the proposed areas of open space and the Heritage Rail Trail.

Comprehensive Plan Issues

- The 30.2 acres currently within the Estates at Hoffman Farms PUD are identified in the Hilliard Comprehensive Plan as Park/Open Space. The portion of the site that is located between the Estates at Hoffman Farms PUD and Elliott Road is within the Big Darby Focus Area, and is recommended for Conservation Development with a maximum overall density of 1 dwelling unit per acre and with a minimum of 50 percent of the gross area preserved as open space. Open space areas should be preserved or restored to a natural state, allow for public access (via walking and biking paths, and public parking on adjacent streets) and be connected whenever possible with the goal of creating a greenway system throughout the Focus Area. Open spaces shall be landscaped with

native plants that require little care, and with an emphasis of encouraging a variety of habitat and natural spaces including wetlands, prairies, and forests.

- Lot sizes for single-family residential should be wide ranging, and include small traditional lots from 4,000 to 8,000 square feet as well as larger estate lots of up to one acre. Architecture should be diverse, consisting of farmhouse, prairie, or craftsman style with simple forms, varying colors, and front porches. Parking and garages should not dominate the front of the building and shall be accessed from the side or rear. Roadways should have a neighborhood character and narrow pavement widths. Street design should incorporate swales and curbed streets where appropriate. Pedestrian and bicycle networks should be provided in conjunction with each development and connect to the larger local/regional trail systems, and the internal greenway network.

Darby Accord Issues:

- The Big Darby Accord Watershed Master Plan recommends the portion of the site on the east side of Elliott Road for low density residential uses with 50 percent open space and 1 dwelling unit per acre. Key recommendations in the Land Use Plan include: protect Tiers 1, 2, and 3 within the Land Conservation Strategy to create a network of green infrastructure; promote regional recreational trail development; provide areas for mixed land use to support residential development; and apply low impact development (LID) techniques into site design. In areas where development has already occurred it is still important to assess where restoration could occur to restore habitat areas and improve the overall environmental conditions. Increased development westward into the planning area as well as planned future development areas identified in the plan will require additional park land and facilities, including active recreation fields for soccer and other organized sports. Generally, the location of facilities should maximize access and be centrally located to neighborhood centers. At least 75 percent of the open space area in the conservation development should be contiguous.
- Well-designed conservation developments may benefit the whole community in terms of storm water management. These developments usually have less impervious cover and provide more open space for water infiltration. Natural areas, such as wetlands or native plantings that are a part of the conservation development's open space can help manage storm water by reducing the volume of runoff and cleaning the storm water during the infiltration process. Conservation developments usually site homes on smaller lots with less emphasis on minimum lot size. The same number of homes is clustered on a smaller portion of the total available land. The remaining land, which would have been allocated to individual homes sites, is now converted into protected open space and shared by the residents of the subdivision and possibly the entire community. The planting of additional vegetation, clustering tree areas, and using native plants is encouraged. Greater open space set asides are encouraged in all conservation development areas by a sliding scale approach that allows the gross density to rise if the net area consumed by development is reduced. Appropriate density increases must consider impact on local utilities and should be evaluated on a case by case basis.

Traffic and Access Issues:

- A traffic study was submitted and is being evaluated by the Franklin County Engineer's Office and City of Hilliard staff.

Proposed Hilliard Conservation District Plan and Text

- The purpose of the HCD is to support the goals and intent of the Big Darby Accord. The primary mission of the Accord is to preserve, protect and improve the Big Darby Watershed’s unique ecosystem, and to promote responsible growth within environmentally sensitive areas. The HCD is created to promote the general public welfare, encourage the efficient use of land and resources, promote greater efficiency in public utility services, and encourage innovation in the planning and building of all types of development. The HCD achieves this purpose by allowing development that:
 - 1) Permanently preserves and integrates open space within residential developments;
 - 2) Offers landowners alternatives to standard tract development;
 - 3) Establishes a less sprawling, more efficient use of land, streets and utilities;
 - 4) Preserves and enhances the natural ecosystem of the area;
 - 5) Creates usable and accessible open space, recreational areas, and green corridors for wildlife, walking trails and/or bike paths; and
 - 6) Encourages creativity in design through a controlled process of review and approval of the development plan and related documents.

Proposed Plan

- The proposed plan consists of 278 single-family lots on 190.4 acres (1.46 dwelling units per acre). A total of 98.6 acres of open space (51.8 percent of the overall site) is proposed. Based on 278 residential units, a total of 9.73 acres of park land is required with this development. The plan shows 46.7 acres of park land will be dedicated to the City of Hilliard. Approximately 52 acres of open space is to be owned and maintained by the Tarlton Meadows homeowners association. Reserve ‘G’ is 3.2 acres located in the center of the site and consists of natural play areas, pedestrian paths and bio-retention areas. All reserve areas feature multi-use paths. Staff recommends that the multi-use path be extended to the western boundary of the proposed park land in Subarea ‘D’. All reserve areas with the exception of Reserve ‘C’ are contiguous. The existing wetland in the eastern end of the site will be preserved and a 25-foot no-disturb zone is proposed. The proposed development text requires house elevations facing key visibility locations to have additional architectural design features and mounding and/or landscape screening.
- The proposed plan includes the following:
 - 1) Conservation development elements:
 - Permanently preserves 98.6 acres of park land and open space (51.8%)
 - Protects existing Tier 1 and Tier 3 land
 - Includes reforestation, prairie restoration, and bio-retention areas
 - Provides a variety of lot sizes including smaller cluster homes
 - Provides multi-use paths in each open space reserve area
 - 2) Provides a 25-foot no-disturb zone around the existing wetland in the eastern end of the site. Additionally, proposed lots are not closer than 30 feet from the no-disturb zone.
 - 3) Provides park land and open space areas that are 99 percent contiguous and connected through the proposed multi-use path system.

Subarea ‘A1’ (Single-family) – 30.2 acres

- A maximum of 31 lots are permitted in this subarea. Development standards include 80-foot minimum lot widths, 135-foot minimum lot depths, minimum 25-foot front yards, minimum 5-foot side yards, minimum 15-foot total side yards, minimum 20-foot rear yards, minimum 2,000-square-foot one-story dwellings, and minimum 2,200 square feet for dwellings greater than one story.

Subarea ‘A2’ (Single-family) – 60.5 acres

- A maximum of 97 lots are permitted in this subarea. Development standards include 75-foot minimum lot widths, 135-foot minimum lot depths, minimum 25-foot front yards, minimum 5-foot side yards, minimum 15-foot total side yards, minimum 20-foot rear yards, minimum 1,600-square-foot one-story dwellings, and minimum 1,800 square feet for dwellings greater than one story.

Subarea ‘B’ (Single-family) – 31.6 acres

- A maximum of 72 lots are permitted in this subarea. Development standards include 60-foot minimum lot widths, 125-foot minimum lot depths, minimum 25-foot front yards, minimum 5-foot side yards, minimum 10-foot total side yards, minimum 20-foot rear yards, minimum 1,400-square-foot one-story dwellings, and minimum 1,600 square feet for dwellings greater than one story.

Subarea ‘C’ (Single-family age targeted patio homes) – 21.4 acres

- A maximum of 78 lots are permitted in this subarea. Development standards include 50-foot minimum lot widths, 115-foot minimum lot depths, minimum 20-foot front yards, minimum 5-foot side yards, minimum 10-foot total side yards, minimum 20-foot rear yards, minimum 1,500 square feet for dwellings.
- A minimum 50-foot-wide landscape buffer is proposed between Subarea ‘C’ and the two adjacent residential properties to the north.

Subarea ‘D’ (Public park land) – 46.7 acres to be dedicated to the City

- Exceeds the park land dedication required per Code.



May 13, 2015

Elliott Road, LLC
c/o Thomas L. Hart, Esq.
2 Miranova Pl, Ste. 700
Columbus OH 43215
thart@isaacwiles.com

Subject: Case #AP-15-01

Dear Mr. Hart:

The Big Darby Accord Advisory Panel considered Case #AP-15-01, 4608/4643 Elliot Road at the May 12, 2015 meeting.

The Panel recommended **disapproval** of Case #AP-15-01 with the following findings of fact:

1. Proposal is not a conservation development design.
2. Insufficient information was presented to determine if a sufficient wetland buffer is provided in accordance with guidance found on page 5-5 of the Watershed Master Plan.
3. Density is too high.
4. Open space does not meet the 75% contiguity standard for a conservation development.

Respectfully,



Christine Leed
Big Darby Accord Advisory Panel Secretary

cc: John Talentino, Hilliard City Planner